Redressing Health Disparities with Information

Jon E. Rohde, MD Director (former) EQUITY Project South Africa

Redressing Health Disparities with Information

- Introduce the South African health system the setting and the workload for nurses
- Describe the development of the HMIS
- Illustrate the usefulness of the information to redressing inequity
- Community involvement in seeking equity
- Principles of developing an appropriate HMIS
- Examples from other countries



















South African Health System

- 270 District Hospitals; 267 Health Centers; 3670 Nurse-run Clinics serving 40 million
- Eastern Cape 7 million poorest province
- 92 small hospitals; 55 Health centers; 750 Clinics
- 250 doctors (all in hospitals); 15,000 nurses
- 15 million clinic OPD visits/year
- Routine FP, EPI, STI, TB, Antenatal care
- Diarrhea (cholera), malnutrition, hypertension and obesity, violence and motor accidents and then-
- HIV

ECape Contrasts Housing



ECape Contrasts Density of Population



ECape Contrasts Health Facilities





Information System

- 9 different competing and non-comparable systems – just for "routine stats"!!
- Independent systems for each vertical program: EPI, FP, STIs, TB, Genetics, malaria, environment and more.....
- Some 2500 "essential drugs and supplies"
- No forms, no registers, no feedback and no know use of the information

A Divided Province - Inequities within the EC **Population Density & Poverty** in the Eastern Cape **Population Poverty Distribution**

MORTALITY RATES IN THE EASTERN CAPE



Estimated Adult HIV Positive Rate 1999



Health Expenditure Per Capita 1996/1997 to 1998/1999



EQUITY Project

- Improve management of resources
- Improve Equity
- Measure disparities in order to redress
 - Baseline sample surveys
 - Annual resurvey to see progress
 - Routine information system to enable managers to visualise the problems and to see the effects of their actions

"Minimum Essential Data"

- Workload and staff under and over 5 years
- Essential services new and old FP, new and repeat ANC, Complete immunisation, All STIs, TB case load, HIV tests positive
- Patients referred to hospital
- Drugs out of stock 10 key items only
- Supervision visit received
- All recorded on a single page monthly form

Tally Sheet

NAME OF	ec Empilweni CHC					Μ	ONTH:		YEAR:	
First antenatal visit	00000	00000	00000	00000	00000	00000	00000	00000	00000	00000
Oral pill cycle	00000	00000	00000	00000	00000	00000	00000	00000	00000	00000
Nuristerate injection	00000 00000									
Depo-provera/Petogen injection	00000 00000									
IUCD inserted	00000	00000	00000	00000	00000	00000	00000	00000	00000	00000
Condoms distributed	00000 00000 00000 00000 00000									
Case treated as STI - new	00000 00000 00000									
Male urethral discharge - new	00000	00000	00000	00000	00000	00000	00000	00000	00000	00000
STI contact slip issued	00000 00000									
STI contact treated - new	00000	00000	00000	00000	00000	00000	00000	00000	00000	00000
Violence against woman	00000	00000	00000	00000	00000	00000	00000	00000	00000	00000
HIV counseled - male	00000	00000	00000	00000	00000	00000	00000	00000	00000	00000
HIV counseled test done - male	00000	00000	00000	00000	00000	00000	00000	00000	00000	00000
HIV positive test - female	00000	00000	00000	00000	00000	00000	00000	00000	00000	00000
HIV positive test - male	00000	00000	00000	00000	00000	00000	00000	00000	00000	00000

TOTAL

FAMILY PLANNING REGISTER											CLINIC						
										YEAR							
NAME	ADDRESS	#LIVING	METHOD	Starting	JAN	FEB	MAR	ARP	MAY	JUN	JUL	AUG	SEP	OCT	NOV	DEC	CONTINUE
		CHILDREN	1	date						••••				-			NEXT YEAR
Theresa Brown		3	IUD	6/00	Χ-					→							
Jill Hill		1	Depo	01-Sep	_		⇒										
Thembi Mafoka		0	Condom	02-Jan	Χ-	→											
Xoliswa Jones		1	pill	02-Feb	Χ-			→									

Key indicators for Action

- Work load patients/nurse/day
- Coverage: immunisation, FP,
- Drug stock outs % that ran out in month
- Disease outbreaks: diarrhea, flu
- Quality of care: standard treatment for STI
- Continuity of care: TB, hypertension
- Severity of cases: referral rates

Immunisation report

- Previously had 40 plus data items
- Now, % of infants fully immunised this month
- Possible problems:
 - Vaccine stock out
 - Refrigerator not working
 - Nursing absence
 - Lack of community motivation
 - No outreach services

Call, or go find out how to help!

Immunisation Coverage 2001



Immunisation % by clinic - MBASHE



Mbashe - Measles vs fully immunised



% months DTP_Hib vacc Out of stock









WHO mandated TB Info

٠

strDataFieldPatients not transferred inPatients from TB clinic in other health districtPatients from TB clinic in same health districtPatients from HospitalPatients from ElsewherePulmonary tuberculosis (011)Primary tuberculosis (010)Other tuberculosis (012-018)All PTB - Smear+ (irrespective of culture)All PTB - Smear-/culture+All PTB - Smear-/culture-All PTB - Culture not done/results not inAll PTB - Bacteriology not doneNew PTB - Smear+ (irrespective of culture)New PTB - Smear-/culture+New PTB - Smear-/culture-New PTB - Culture not done/results not inNew PTB - Bacteriology not doneNew Smear+ PTB - White males 00-14 yearsNew Smear+ PTB - White males 15-19 yearsNew Smear+ PTB - White males 20-39 yearsNew Smear+ PTB - White males 40-59 yearsNew Smear+ PTB - White males 60+ yearsNew Smear+ PTB - White females 00-14 yearsNew Smear+ PTB - White females 15-19 yearsNew Smear+ PTB - White females 20-39 yearsNew Smear+ PTB - White females 40-59 yearsNew Smear+ PTB - White females 60+ yearsNew Smear+ PTB - Coloured males 00-14 yearsNew Smear+ PTB - Coloured males 15-19 yearsNew Smear+ PTB - Coloured males 20-39 yearsNew Smear+ PTB - Coloured males 40-59 yearsNew Smear+ PTB - Coloured males 60+ yearsNew Smear+ PTB - Coloured females 00-14 ýearsNew Smear+ PTB - Coloured females 15-19 yearsNew Smear+ PTB - Coloured females 20-39 yearsNew Smear+ PTB - Coloured females 40-59 yearsNew Smear+ PTB - Coloured females 60+ yearsNew Smear+ PTB - Asian males 00-14 yearsNew Smear+ PTB - Asian males 15-19 yearsNew Śmear+ PTB - Asian males 20-39 yearsNew Sméar+ PTB - Asian males 40-59 yearsNew Sméar+ PTB - Asian males 60+ yearsNew Smear+ PTB - Asian females 00-14 yearsNew Smear+ PTB - Asian females 15-19 yearsNew Smear+ PTB - Asian females 20-39 yearsNew Smear+ PTB - Asian females 40-59 vearsNew Smear+ PTB - Asian females 60+ vearsNew Smear+ PTB - Black males 00-14 vearsNew Smear+ PTB - Black males 15-19 vearsNew Smear+ PTB - Black males 20-39 yearsNew Smear+ PTB - Black males 40-59 yearsNew Smear+ PTB - Black males 60+ yearsNew Smear+ PTB - Black females 00-14 yearsNew Smear+ PTB - Black females 15-19 yearsNew Smear+ PTB - Black females 20-39 yearsNew Smear+ PTB - Black females 40-59 yearsNew Smear+ PTB - Black females 60+ yearsDOT New adults intensive phase - communityDOT New adults intensive phase - clinicDOT New adults intensive phase - workplaceDOT New adults intensive phase - otherDOT New adults intensive phase - no supportDOT New adults intensive phase - total registered DOT New adults continuation phase - community DOT New adults continuation phase - clinic DOT New adults continuation phase workplaceDOT New adults continuation phase - otherDOT New adults continuation phase - no supportDOT New adults continuation phase - total registeredDOT Retr adults intensive phase - communityDOT Retr adults intensive phase - clinicDOT Retr adults intensive phase - workplaceDOT Retr adults intensive phase - otherDOT Retr adults intensive phase - no supportDOT Retr adults intensive phase - total registeredDOT Retr adults continuation phase - communityDOT Retr adults continuation phase - clinicDOT Retr adults continuation phase - workplaceDOT Retr adults continuation phase otherDOT Retr adults continuation phase - no supportDOT Retr adults continuation phase - total registeredNew - Pre-treatmentNew - Smear not done at 2-3 monthsNew - Still positive at 3 monthsNew - Converted at 2 monthsNew - Converted at 3 monthsRelapse - Pre-treatmentRelapse - Smear not done at 2-3 monthsRelapse - Still positive at 3 monthsRelapse - Converted at 3 monthsOther retr - Pre-treatmentOther retr - Smear not done at 2-3 monthsOther retr - Still positive at 3 monthsOther retr - Converted at 3 monthsNew No smear at 2-3 months - DiedRetr No smear at 2-3 months - DiedNew No smear at 2-3 months - Transferred outRetr No smear at 2-3 months - Transferred outNew No smear at 2-3 months - InterruptedRetr No smear at 2-3 months -InterruptedOutcome - Pulmonary tuberculosis (011)Outcome - Primary tuberculosis (010)Outcome - Other tuberculosis (012-018)Outcome - New Smear+ CuredOutcome - New Smear+ CompletedOutcomé - New Smear+ FailureOutcome - New Smear+ InterruptedOutcome - New Smear+ Died of TBOutcome - New Smear+ Died of non-TBOutcome - New Smear+ Transferred outOutcome - New Smear+ Not TBOutcome - Retr Smear+ CuredOutcome - Retr Smear+ CompletedOutcome - Retr Smear+ FailureOutcome - Retr Smear+ InterruptedOutcome - Retr Smear+ Died of TBOutcome - Retr Smear+ Died of non-TBOutcome - Retr Smear+ Transferred outOutcome - Retr Smear+ Not TBOutcome - New Smear-/Culture+ CuredOutcome -New Smear-/Culture+ CompletedOutcome - New Smear-/Culture+ FailureOutcome - New Smear-/Culture+ InterruptedOutcome - New Smear-/Culture+ Died of TBOutcome - New Smear-/Culture+ Died of non-TBOutcome - New Smear-/Culture+ Transferred outOutcome - New Smear-/Culture+ Not TBOutcome - Retr Smear-/Culture+ CuredOutcome - Retr Smear-/Culture+ CompletedOutcome - Retr Smear-/Culture+ FailureOutcome - Retr Smear-/Culture+ InterruptedOutcome - Retr Smear-/Culture+ Died of TBOutcome - Retr Smear-/Culture+ Died of non-TBOutcome - Retr Smear-/Culture+ Transferred outOutcome - Retr Smear-/Culture+ Not TBOutcome - New w/o Bacteriological OK CompletedOutcome - New w/o Bacteriological OK FailureOutcome - New w/o Bacteriological OK InterruptedOutcome - New w/o Bacteriological OK Died of TBOutcome - New w/o Bacteriological OK Died of non-TBOutcome - New w/o Bacteriological OK Transferred outOutcome - New w/o Bacteriological OK Not TBOutcome - Retr w/o Bacteriological OK CompletedOutcome - Retr w/o Bacteriological OK FailureOutcome - Retr w/o Bacteriological OK InterruptedOutcome - Retr w/o Bacteriological OK Died of TBOutcome - Retr w/o Bacteriological OK Died of non-TBOutcome - Retr w/o Bacteriological OK Transferred outOutcome - Retr w/o Bacteriological OK Not TBTB case load (all cases)Retr PTB - Smear+ (irrespective of culture)Retr PTB - Smear-/culture+Retr PTB - Smear-/culture-Retr PTB - Culture not done/results not inRetr PTB - Bacteriology not doneTB lab costTB drug costTB treatment costDemography 0-14 yearsDemography 15-19 yearsDemography 20-39 yearsDemography 40-59 yearsDemography 60 years and olderDemography AsianDemography BlackDemography ColouredDemography WhiteDemography FemaleDemography MaleDOT cases - communityDOT cases - facilityDOT cases - workplaceDOT cases otherDOT cases - no supportDOT cases - total registeredAll retr cases - pre-treatment

	Streamlined Monthly TB I	nformation						
Data type	Monthly TB Data Fields	Data Source						
Case finding	Suspected TB case	Patient register						
	TB case diagnosed - new	Lab register						
Case prevalence	TB patient under treatment	TB register						
	MDR patient on outpatient treatment	TB register						
	TB patient on DOTS - Facility	TB register						
	TB patient on DOTS - Community	TB register						
Sputum Conversion	2/3 month sputum due	Desk Calender						
	2/3 month sputum sent	Lab register						
	2/3 month sputum positive	Lab register						
Potential Interrupters	TB suspend - new	Suspender Register						
	TB suspend - restarted	Suspender Register						
Child contacts	Child under 5 years - TB contact	Blue cards						
	Child under 5 years - TB treatment	Blue cards						
Monthly outcomes	Outcome - PTB Cured	Blue cards						
	Outcome - PTB Completed	Blue cards						
	Outcome - PTB Failure	Blue cards						
	Outcome - PTB Interrupted	Blue cards						
	Outcome - PTB Died	Blue cards						
	Outcome - PTB Transferred out	Blue cards						

TB suspenders restarted on Rx



Interrupted as % Outcomes



Interrupted PTB — Linear (Interrupted PTB)

Locally relevant data items

- Bilharzia cases (school age)
- Malaria (only a few districts in So Africa)
- Rape and HIV response
- Industrial accidents
- New toilets installed in schools





Diarrhoea under 5 years - new - 2001







Improved Management Decisions

- Personnel Deployment
- Drug ordering to avoid stock-outs
- Better Supervision more supportive
- Reallocated finances

Nurse clin workload - patients/nurse/day



Nurse clinical workload/day Emalahleni District



Facility level Indicators

Availability of 10 Key Indicator Drugs



Improving Supervision activities



Health Expenditure Per Capita 1996/1997 to 1998/1999



Per capita Allocation for PHC 02-03



The EQUITY Index - 1997 to 2002





- Start small, limit the requests for data
- One page rule: reports fit on ONE PAGE
- Paper based do it by hand till all understand where the numbers come from
- Users identify priorities for info they need

- Data collected only if it makes an indicator
- Action linked to each indicator (up or down inspires some action)
- Indicators are exactly that they INDICATE what needs attention, not what to do
- Indicators MUST be interpreted to make information which is used for ACTION to give results that can be measured
- Managers act on low performers figure out why and redress the needs –ACT!

- Chose only data period likely to show a change: monthly, quarterly, annually – collect and report only as often as needed to see a change
- Feedback and action is the strategy for sustainability

- One-page rule of data forms
- Tick registers and tally sheets simple and easy to use and sum at end of month
- Registers for continuity the real measure of quality is continuity of care
- Let computers come later and with a flexible program that can accommodate local variations as well as do the donkey work of statistics

- Don't let the higher authorities dictate the routine system – force their info requests to clearly define their needs - where these legitimately exceed the routine report, make a part of annual or biannual surveys or audits. Don't overwhelm the workers.
- Establish a national clearing house to approve any and all info requests from "higher up". Let the Committee withstand the pressure from higher up and donors

Information for Equity – examples:

- Community nutrition programs in Indonesia, India, Honduras and Bangladesh –% kids gaining weight – single indicator of progress
- Tanzania nutrition assessment helped focus government efforts to poorest communities
- Bangladesh districts are now ranked annually based on measured progress for children
- Progress of Indian States –ranked states best practises highlighted and recognised
- Progress of Nations UNICEF ranked countries on World Summit for Children goals



Conclusions

- Keep it simple! A little accurate and timely information is worth far more than a lot of late and inaccurate figures.
- Donors and experts PLEASE do NOT overwhelm the system – help strengthen it accept more limited data and see performance improve and disparity reduced
- Consult with the front line workers and meet their needs
- Redress Disparity to bring results and Equity

Obrigado e Boa Sorte!!!

Jon Rohde, MD Management Sciences for Health Cape Town South Africa